

# **Strategic Research Model II**

# Working Conditions of Early Childhood Educators in Nurseries and Kindergartens in Seven Arab Countries

Lebanon, Jordan, Palestine, Egypt, Tunisia, Morocco, and Oman

**Executive Summary** 

1.	About ANECD's Strategic Research Models	4
2.	Research Methodology	4
3.	Research Objective	4
4.	Research Procedures	4
5.	Research Sample	5
6.	Regional Results:	5
6	.1. Desk review results:	5
	6.1.1. Key findings:	5
	6.1.2. Major challenges:	6
6	.2. Survey Results:	7
	6.2.1. Characteristics of respondents:	7
	6.2.2 Working conditions of educators:	8
6	.3. Needs of the workforce:	. 10
6	.4. Suggestions and recommendations:	. 10
7.	Key findings at the national level:	.11
7	.1. Palestine Results:	. 11
	7.1.1. Palestine desk review results:	. 11
	7.1.2. Results of the questionnaire in Palestine:	. 12
7	.2. Jordan Results:	. 12
	7.2.1. Jordan desk review results:	. 12
	7.2.2. Results of the questionnaire in Jordan:	. 13
7	.3. Morocco Results:	. 14
	7.3.1. Morocco desk review results:	. 14
	7.3.2. Results of the questionnaire in Morocco:	. 14
7	.4. Tunisia Results:	. 15
	7.4.1. Tunisia desk review results:	. 15
	7.4.2. Results of the questionnaire in Tunisia:	. 16
7	.5. Oman Results:	. 17
	7.5.1. Oman desk review results:	. 17
	7.5.2. Results of the questionnaire in Oman:	. 17
7	.6. Lebanon Results:	. 17
	7.6.1. Lebanon desk review results:	17

7.6.2. Results of the questionnaire in Lebanon:	18
7.7. Egypt Results:	19
7.7.1. Egypt desk review results:	19
7.7.2. Results of the questionnaire in Egypt:	19

# 1. About ANECD's Strategic Research Models

The Arab Network for Early Childhood has adopted the strategic research model approach, which provides action plans and organized interventions that contribute to improving the network's action programs to advance the early childhood sector in the Arab world. In the context of strengthening the research component directed to policies and evaluation studies in the network and providing scientific indicators directed to the network's activities, plans, and strategic models, this research activity came about as a comprehensive study to provide quantitative and qualitative indicators about the situation of educators in nurseries and kindergartens in a group of Arab countries; this topic was chosen to be targeted by the second strategic research model in light of the reviews carried out by ANECD's research and evaluation group, reviews that demonstrated the urgent need for further research (in the Arab context) on this topic; This sheds light on the working conditions and expectations of the workforce in this important sector and identifies some skills and competencies for educators in nurseries and kindergartens in Arab countries.

# 2. Research Methodology

The research adopted a mixed approach in collecting data: the quantitative approach was represented in a questionnaire directed to workers in nurseries and kindergartens, and the qualitative approach was represented in a desk review study that included analysis of available documents, data, reports and studies on the condition of workers in nurseries and kindergartens in the sample countries.

# 3. Research Objective

The research attempted to answer the following main question: "What are the working conditions of educators in nurseries and kindergartens in Arab countries: the contexts in which they work, and their rights and employment benefits?"

As part of the research's attempt to answer its main question, it provided rich data about educators in nurseries and kindergartens in the sample countries and about their working conditions to find ways to advance working conditions in this sector and thus improve the condition of children in nurseries and kindergartens.

The research also provided data on the efforts made in the Arab countries targeted in this research by presenting the results of the desk review that analyzed documents related to workers in nurseries and kindergartens in the sample Arab countries and presenting the rich quantitative data provided by the field study in which a sample of workers in nurseries and kindergartens participated.

#### 4. Research Procedures

Data for this research was collected using a digital questionnaire adapted from a study tool developed by the **International Step by Step Association**<sup>1</sup> within the **Early Childhood** 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> International Step by step Association.... <a href="https://www.issa.nl/">https://www.issa.nl/</a>

**Workforce Initiative**, which aimed to assess early childhood workforce needs in the home visiting program.

The questionnaire was reviewed and validated in its Arabic version by the research and evaluation team at the Arab Network. The questionnaire included a set of sections addressed to workers in nurseries and kindergartens, made up of closed questions with single or multiple choices. Each section of the questionnaire measured a different related variable that the research team saw necessary in collecting its corresponding data. The questionnaire was digitized, and its link was circulated to available samples of respondents using a randomized survey.

A desk review report was also prepared for each participating country by the national research coordinator, according to a unified proposed structure and sections for the report that were circulated to the national coordinators. This made it possible to shed light on issues that represent the specificity of each country and serve regional comparison trends. The national coordinator in each country undertook the activities of implementing the questionnaire and communicating it with the relevant authorities in the country.

# 5. Research Sample

Seven Arab countries were chosen to represent the study sample: Palestine, Jordan, Egypt, Lebanon, Tunisia, Morocco, and Oman. The respondents to the study tool were as follows:

The nature of the respondent's work	Percentage %
Kindergarten educator or teacher	85.5
A kindergarten educator or teacher in charge of management	6.5
Gender of respondent	Percentage %
Gender of respondent	reiceillage /
Female	90.7

# 6. Regional Results:

#### 6.1. Desk review results:

# 6.1.1. Key findings:

According to what was provided by the national desk review reports, which relied on reviewing documents related to the nursery and kindergarten sector in the sample countries, it was possible to produce a set of general results, the most prominent of which are:

- In most sample countries, the sector is witnessing tangible development that affects more than one area, whether in terms of enrolment, quality, or infrastructure development.
- 2. Most countries have developed legislation regulating workers in this sector, whether at the level of their selection mechanisms, rights, or working conditions.
- 3. In many countries, governance systems and quality control mechanisms have been adopted for the sector, which provided data that contributed to directing development programs.
- National efforts are being made at the country level related to capacity-building programs for workers in the sector, and there are good partnerships with higher education institutions in this field.
- 5. Some countries have included workers in the sector into the system of workers in the civil service sector, enabling the formation of unions and regulating bodies for these workers
- 6. The reality of early childhood workforce conditions in Arab countries is a multifaceted challenge that requires integrated efforts from governments, civil society, and international institutions to protect the rights of these workers and, thus, children's rights and ensure their decent future.
- 7. For the social upbringing method to become effective in the early childhood stage in the Arab region, we must underscore the great educational importance of preparing and qualifying educators for nurseries and kindergartens.
- 8. Creating close connections between nurseries and kindergartens on one side and parents on the other side is highly important to ensure that there is no conflict between the goals, methods, and joint work approach in each of them and to achieve the educational and social goals for which nurseries and kindergartens were established.
- 9. Kindergartens cannot and will not be a substitute for the many functions of the family, but they complement the functions of the family and help it succeed in its educational principles of rearing and raising a preschool child in the best way.

# **6.1.2. Major challenges:**

- 1. The sector suffers from an imbalance in mainstreaming efforts, disparities in access, and unequal opportunities for sustainability of enrollment.
- 2. The sector suffers from the diversity of stakeholders and their differing agendas, which leads to the absence of unified efforts for advancement and a unified framework, which leads to multiple educational practices that are difficult to evaluate and follow up.
- 3. The sector suffers from a failure to attract qualified workers in light of the low wages, the absence of frameworks regulating their work, the absence of legal frameworks that guarantee the rights and duties of workers, and the interruption of salaries during the summer holidays, which leaves workers in a constant search to improve their situation by looking for other jobs.
- 4. There is an abundance of official documents related to the sector, specifically those pertaining to workers' competencies. However, these documents are still locked in some offices and have not been translated into operational policies that advance the sector towards the desired quality.

- 5. There is a lack of community awareness of the importance of preschool education and the purely profit-making outlook of some investors, which reduces their awareness of the importance of investing in this sector and the lack of allocation of budgets supporting education in this sector.
- 6. The lack of adequate availability of early childhood education services in all regions disrupts the ideology of justice in access and equality.
- 7. There is a lack of a holistic, long-term development vision for the sector in many cases, as the development process requires strategic interventions at the level of the teacher, the student, the curricula, and the enabling contexts of teaching and learning.
- 8. There is a lack of mandatory preschool education and an absence of government or government-supported services for this sector in some sample countries.

# **6.2.** Survey Results:

The data provided by the questionnaire circulated to workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the sample countries showed the following data:

# **6.2.1. Characteristics of respondents:**

- 1. 8,717 workers in nurseries and kindergartens in the sample countries responded to the questionnaire.
- 2. Most respondents were female educators (90%);
- 3. 25% had a high school diploma or less.
- 4. 75% of them worked in public sector institutions.
- 5. Nearly two-thirds of respondents reported not having an assistant educator working with them.
- 6. Nearly 80% of respondents reported being between 22 and 45 years old.
- 7. Most respondents (85%) do not have health problems or disabilities.
- 8. Most respondents (85%) work full-time, except in Morocco, where only 50% work full-time.
- More than 70% of educators in the participating countries are between 22 and 45 years old, and these results reflect that the youth group constitutes the most significant percentage of the workforce in nurseries and kindergartens.
- 10. The largest percentage of educators in all participating countries have obtained a university education (baccalaureate or master's degree) or a professional/technical degree.
- 11. Most of the workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the research hold specializations in education, with a small percentage of those holding specializations in early childhood, except in Tunisia, where approximately 50% hold specializations in early childhood.
- 12. The largest percentage of educators work in private sector institutions, while the percentage of those working in civil society organizations was the lowest in all countries.
- 13. There is a difference in the distribution of years of experience between different countries, as we find that the highest percentages of educators have at least four years of experience.

# **6.2.2 Working conditions of educators:**

- 1. 73% of respondents reported that they only teach one or two classes.
- 2. 75% of respondents reported not moving close to their workplace.
- 3. 87% of respondents reported having an employment contract/document that regulates their work in the organization.
- 4. 50% of respondents reported that they work on an annual contract, and 25% of them work on a permanent contract.
- 5. 96% of respondents reported being informed and introduced to the institution's work programme, goals, and vision before starting work.
- 6. 88% of respondents reported the presence of an employment contract and documents specifying the rights of educators working in the institution.
- 7. 90% reported that the documents specify the nature of the salary and benefits that the organization's employees receive.
- 8. 80% of respondents reported that the job advertisement specified the nature of the qualifications for it.
- 9. 80% of respondents reported that the advertisement did not specify a specific gender for recruitment nor as a condition for employment.
- 10. 78% of respondents reported that official documents (employment contracts or job descriptions) did not stipulate the minimum required experience, except in the case of Tunisia.
- 11. 75% of respondents reported that official documents (employment contracts or job descriptions) stipulate that it is mandatory to join training programs.
- 12. 90% of respondents reported receiving their wages on time according to agreement with the organization's management.
- 13. 50% of respondents reported that their income equals the minimum wage in the country where they work.
- 14. 80% of respondents reported that they benefit from social security or insurance systems provided by the institution.
- 15. 83% of respondents reported that the program does not provide additional recognition for their work (e.g., awards or public recognition for achievement).
- 16. 67% of respondents reported that the number of working hours stipulated in the job description or official documents is between 4 and 6 hours per day, while 30% reported that the number of hours is between 6 and 8 per day.
- 17. 76% of respondents reported being satisfied with their responsibilities, while 20% were somewhat satisfied.
- 18. 85% of respondents reported that the working hours stipulated in the employment contract are not exceeded.
- 19. 60% of respondents reported that regular and organized meetings are held between educators in the institution for research, evaluation, and planning.
- 20. 54% of respondents reported that there is a reference for educators to submit complaints.
- 21. The largest percentage of participants in the study hold educator positions in nurseries and kindergartens, with a decrease in the percentage of those assigned to the duties of assistant educator.
- 22. Most educators in participating countries do not have an assistant.

- 23. The highest percentages of nurseries and kindergartens, whether in the public or private sector, focus on traditional academic education, focusing on subjects considered basic, such as mathematics and science, with less emphasis on areas such as the arts.
- 24. Most nurseries and kindergartens have minimal overcrowding in classes.
- 25. Most of the educators in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted for research did not move from one educational institution to another, except in Tunisia, which signifies a state of job stability for the workforce.
- 26. Most workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted for the research are familiar with the institution's goals, work approach, mission and vision.
- 27. Most workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the research have signed employment contracts or regulatory documents that specify the roles and tasks required for their work in the institution.
- 28. Most workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted for the research have official documents to determine their rights.
- 29. Most educators in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the research reported the existence of employment contracts and job description documents that accurately specify their wages and entitlements, except in the case of Tunisia and the case of Oman.
- 30. Most workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the study reported that the job advertisement specified the educational qualifications required for the job.
- 31. The highest percentage of nursery and kindergarten institutions in Arab countries require a workforce with high educational attainment and specialization.
- 32. The highest percentage of educators in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the research reported that the job advertisement did not specify an age group for the job, except in the case of Morocco, where the advertisement specified the age group.
- 33. The highest percentage of educators in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the research reported that the job advertisement did not specify the area of residence as one of the employment requirements.
- 34. The largest percentage of educators reported that they receive training sessions in the institution where they work.
- 35. There are relatively high percentages of educators who receive unfair wages, and in many cases, less than the minimum wage in the country.
- 36. Educators in nurseries and kindergartens in the participating Arab countries suffer from the problem of low wages and lack of fair benefits and returns.
- 37. Less than 45% of educators in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the study believe that their income matches that of their counterparts.
- 38. Annual leaves are granted for different periods, perhaps the most prominent of which is summer vacation (three months), and all countries provide sick, marriage, death, maternity and paternity leaves.
- 39. Most workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the study reported that they do not receive additional rewards or appreciation for their excellence in performance.
- 40. Most preschools and kindergartens in participating countries adhere to fair working hours for workforce rights.

- 41. There is a high percentage (48%) of educators in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted for the study who suffer from the scarcity of administrative and logistical support that they receive from those in charge of the institution.
- 42. Most educators meet with educational program coordinators periodically.
- 43. Most workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the study reported a reference to which they can submit complaints, except the cases of Tunisia and Oman, where the reference is unavailable.
- 44. Most of the workers in kindergartens and nurseries in the Arab countries targeted by the study reported that they have priority in enrolling their children in the institution in which they work.

#### 6.3. Needs of the workforce:

- 1. Providing assistants for educators in nurseries and kindergartens, especially in countries that witness overcrowded classrooms and an accumulation of workloads, such as the number of working hours or the number of classes for which the educator is responsible.
- 2. Supporting stability in nursery and kindergarten institutions, especially in countries with high rates of educators moving from one institution to another.
- 3. Improving wages for the workforce in nurseries and kindergartens in all participating countries.
- 4. Developing training programs, whether in the texts of contracts or job descriptions or the extent of their implementation in institutions.
- 5. Adopting clear employment contracts and job descriptions specifying age, gender, educational level, years of experience required, mandatory participation in training programs, etc.
- 6. Institutions should provide incentives for the workforce to maintain the continuity and quality of services.
- 7. Ensuring continuity and stability in the institutions through the use of permanent or semipermanent employment contracts.
- 8. Providing official references or platforms for submitting complaints to protect the rights of educators.

# 6.4. Suggestions and recommendations:

Among the most prominent suggestions and recommendations that came out of the study, and which the research team deems necessary to work on and advocate for to improve work in the nursery and kindergarten sector, are the following:

- Adopting legal frameworks regulating the roles, rights, and duties of workers in the sector, ensuring their professional stability, health and social coverage, and guaranteeing their financial and moral rights.
- 2. Developing capacity-building programs for workers in the sector, whether pre-service or in-service programs, and requiring workers to join them according to their training needs, provided these programs are validated and in harmony with modern trends and approaches in early childhood science.
- 3. Linking the activities of developing the nursery and kindergarten sector with countries' commitments towards the 2030 Agenda and achieving the relevant, sustainable development goals in harmony with the recommendations of the Transforming Education Summit.
- 4. Developing modern and organised databases related to the sector to enhance policyoriented research activities and evidence-based decision-making.

- 5. Preparing a national curriculum that defines the parameters of the work of nurseries and kindergartens and that is based on modern theories in early childhood science, provided that nurseries adhere to it in a way that limits the discrepancies and multiplicity of curricula used in nurseries and kindergartens.
- 6. Make engineering, technical, and health competency requirements available in nurseries and kindergartens to accommodate children with special needs and disabilities.
- 7. Adopting effective mechanisms to deal with the problem of unlicensed nurseries and kindergartens and low-cost home nurseries -which have negatively affected the quality of care services, thus weakening the confidence and willingness of parents to register their children in nurseries-. This requires activating penal sanctions and civil legal liability for the owners of unlicensed nurseries and kindergartens.

# 7. Key findings at the national level:

Below, we review the most prominent results at the level of each country, whether the results of the desk review report or the results of the questionnaires:

#### 7.1. Palestine Results:

#### 7.1.1. Palestine desk review results:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Palestine showed the following results:

- 1. There are 1,550 kindergartens in the West Bank and 617 in the Gaza Strip.
- 2. There are 95,024 children in kindergartens in the West Bank and 65,713 in the Gaza Strip.
- 3. The Ministry of Education has adopted a policy of opening a preparatory class in some government schools, and the number of government kindergartens has reached 385 government kindergartens in the West Bank and 12 government kindergartens in the Gaza Strip, according to statistics for the academic year 2021-2022.
- 4. There are 321 licensed nurseries, employing 1,240 workers.
- 5. 13.6% of children under five years old were left in inadequate care in 2019.
- 6. Nurseries for children aged 0–4 years are subject to the supervision of the Ministry of Social Development.
- 7. The nursery regulations did not reference the legal nature of the relationship with the nursery owner.
- 8. The texts of Regulation No. 11 of 2011 were consistent with the Palestinian Child Rights Law and the international treaties and conventions to which Palestine acceded.
- 9. There are 10,303 female workers in kindergartens in the West Bank and Gaza, 12.8% of whom hold a high school diploma or less, while 17.7% hold an intermediate diploma and 67.5% hold a bachelor's degree.
- 10. The average number of children per educator was 15.6.
- 11. The average number of children per class was 20.08

# 7.1.2. Results of the questionnaire in Palestine:

The results of implementing the questionnaire in Palestine showed the following indicators:

- 1. 73% of the participating workforce have an educator position, and 20% are management and administrator.
- 2. 81% of educators do not have an assistant.
- 3. (93%) of the educators participating in the study teach the first, second, and third grades of kindergarten
- 4. 80% of educators are in the age group between 22 and 45 years
- 5. 84% of educators hold university degrees, and 12% have a technical or professional degree.
- 6. The largest percentage of the workforce specializes in education (64%) or early childhood (19%).
- 7. 83% of educators are responsible for one class or section.
- 8. In 80% of cases, the number of children in each section is more than 15.
- 9. 33% of educators do not have employment contracts regulating their relationship with the institution in which they work.
- 10. 77% of participants responded that the job advertisement did not require minimum experience.
- 11. 50% of educators reported that their employment contract did not require them to join training programs, but 30% reported not joining training sessions in their institutions.
- 12. Regarding wages, 55% of educators reported that they receive wages less than (26%) or equal to (29%) the minimum wage, and the highest percentage was for those receiving slightly more than the minimum wage (39%).
- 13. 36% of educators believe their income differs from their counterparts in similar environments, such as educators in other institutions, and 33% believe that it matches.
- 14. 82% do not receive any additional incentive for their work.
- 15. 56% of educators reported that the stipulated number of working hours is from 4 to 6 hours, while 41% said it is from 6 to 8 hours.
- 16. 84% reported that their organizations adhere to the stipulated number of working hours and do not exceed them.
- 17. 46% of educators do not receive any administrative or logistical support from the institution where they work.

#### 7.2. Jordan Results:

#### 7.2.1. Jordan desk review results:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Jordan showed the following results:

- 1. The early childhood stage in Jordan includes services provided to children from birth to nine years of age. It is divided into three main stages: nursery for children from one day to the age of four years, the first stage of kindergarten from the age of four to five, and the second stage of kindergarten from the age of five until the age of six, and primary education is for the first three grades.
- The Ministry of Education is responsible for kindergarten services, while the Ministry
  of Social Development regulates nursery services in accordance with official
  legislation.

- 3. A child educator and babysitter qualification curriculum has been prepared so they may receive a professional practice license from the Vocational Training Corporation.
- 4. The number of children enrolled in nurseries reached approximately 12,000 in 2022, and the number of licensed nurseries reached 1,179. The majority of nurseries are in government schools or private nurseries, and home nurseries are still operating without a license or follow-up.
- 5. The enrolment rate of children in the second kindergarten grade was about 61.4% in 2018, with differences between Jordanian children (69.5%) and Syrian children (25.4%).
- 6. All caregivers are female, 55% of whom work in the private sector under the age of 30.
- 7. The diploma or community college degree is most common among educators.
- 8. Approximately 60% of nursery workers have not received any pre-service training.
- 9. There are (2,736) government kindergartens for 2021/2022, including (70,706) children.
- 10. The Ministry of Education sought to train kindergarten teachers, and there are certain set principles for selecting a cadre of teachers.
- 11. The Ministry of Social Development has determined procedures for nurseries through the instructions for licensing official nurseries.

# 7.2.2. Results of the questionnaire in Jordan:

The results of implementing the questionnaire in Jordan showed the following indicators:

- 1. 73% of the respondents hold the educator position, and 15% are responsible for management and administration.
- 2. 86% of educators are between the ages of 22 and 45 years.
- 3. 99% of the educators participating in the study teach at the first, second, and third introductory levels.
- 4. 76% of educators hold university or master's degrees, and 20% have a technical or professional degree.
- 5. 41% of educators specialize in the field of education and 27% in the field of early childhood.
- 6. 91% of educators are responsible for one class or section.
- 7. For 55% of the educators, the number of children in the class was more than 15.
- 8. 75% of educators work in an educational institution affiliated with the public sector.
- 9. 78% of educators have employment contracts regulating their work, and approximately a third have a part-time contract.
- 10. 33% of educators reported that the educational qualifications required in the job advertisement were baccalaureate or less.
- 11. 69% of educators responded that the job advertisement did not require minimum experience.
- 12. 52% of educators reported that their employment contract did not require them to join training programs.
- 13. 52% of educators confirmed they did not attend training seminars in their institutions.
- 14. 46% of educators reported receiving wages equal to the minimum wage.
- 15. 30% of educators believe that their income differs from their counterparts in similar environments, and 42% believe it is the same.
- 16. 67% of educators do not receive any additional appreciation for their work

- 17. 54% of educators reported that the stipulated number of working hours is 4 to 6 hours per day.
- 18. 90% of educators confirmed that their institutions adhere to the stipulated number of working hours and do not exceed them.
- 19. 55% of educators do not receive any administrative or logistical support from the institution where they work.
- 20. 35% of educators do not have a reference for submitting complaints.

#### 7.3. Morocco Results:

#### 7.3.1. Morocco desk review results:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Morocco showed the following results:

- 1. The law stipulates mandatory primary education to reduce disparities and achieve justice in rural and semi-urban areas.
- 2. The national program set financial and pedagogical goals for mainstreaming primary education on the horizon of the 2027/2028 school season.
- 3. The number of departments for the 2018/2019 academic season in rural areas was 16,834, while it was 26,307 in urban areas, and the number of educators for 2020 was approximately 46,519.
- 4. The percentage of the age group school enrolment for this during the 2021/2022 academic season reached more than 72.5%.
- 5. There is a plan to train educators in addition to monitoring and evaluating the skills acquired by children.
- 6. There is a framework law and a national program, and there are ministerial memorandums regarding the commitment to guarantee the minimum wage on the part of working associations, but there is no commitment on the part of some associations to ensure the rights of educators.
- 7. The sector is experiencing a fluctuating development in its expansion, in addition to disparities in access and unequal opportunities for continuing education.
- 8. The sector suffers from multiple interveners and the absence of a unified reference framework.
- 9. The sector lacks equipment and qualified educators and does not meet the standards required for early childhood education.
- 10. The pay is inappropriate for some educators, making them constantly search for other jobs.

# 7.3.2. Results of the questionnaire in Morocco:

The results of implementing the questionnaire in Morocco showed the following indicators:

- 1. 97% of respondents are educators, and 99% of educators do not have an assistant.
- 2. 90% of educators are between the ages of 22 and 45 years
- 3. The majority of educators teach at the first, second, and third introductory levels (99%)
- 4. 50% of the educators hold university degrees, and 45% have a technical or professional degree.

- 5. 46% of educators are responsible for one class or one section, 37% are responsible for two or two classrooms, and 16% are responsible for three or more classes.
- 6. For 37% of educators, the number of children in each class is over 15.
- 7. The largest percentage of educators work in the public sector (82%).
- 8. 95% of educators have employment contracts regulating their relationship with the institution where they work.
- 9. 69% of educators reported that the contract duration is only one year.
- 10. 33% of educators reported that the educational qualifications required in the job advertisement were baccalaureate or less.
- 11. 82% of educators responded that the job advertisement did not require minimum experience.
- 12. 85% of educators reported that their employment contract requires them to join training programs.
- 13. 82% of educators confirmed that they participated in training programs in their institutions.
- 14. 95% of educators reported that they receive wages less than (29%) or equal to (66%) the minimum wage.
- 15. 32% of educators believe that their income differs from their counterparts in similar environments, such as educators in other institutions.
- 16. 89% of educators do not receive any additional incentive for their work.
- 17. 80% of educators reported that the stipulated number of working hours is 4 to 6.
- 18. 89% of educators confirmed that their institutions adhere to the stipulated number of working hours and do not exceed them.
- 19. 44% of educators do not receive any administrative or logistical support from the institution where they work.
- 20. 20% of educators do not have meetings for research, evaluation, and planning between educators in the organisation.
- 21. 34% of educators do not have a reference for submitting complaints.

#### 7.4. Tunisia Results:

#### 7.4.1. Tunisia desk review results:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Tunisia showed the following results:

- 1. The nursery's mission is to accept children between the ages of two months and three years.
- 2. Nurseries are subject to the supervision of the Ministry in charge of Childhood.
- 3. The number of Tunisian nurseries reached 483 during the 2022 academic year, with 31,739 educators working in them.
- 4. Kindergarten is attended by children between the ages of 3 and 6 years.
- 5. According to 2022 statistics, the Ministry of Family, Women, Children and the Seniors supervises 5,680 kindergartens, in which 247,000 children are enrolled who are supervised by 17,500 employees.
- 6. The recruitment mechanism differs between the public and private sectors. In the public sector, it is through external debates that are published to the public, while in the private sector, it is through direct assignment.
- 7. Workers in private sector nurseries are subject to the provisions of the agreement regarding kindergartens and nurseries.

- 8. Workers in nurseries and kindergartens in the public sector are subject to Law No. 112 of 1983.
- Workers in the early childhood sector have special licenses for sickness and occupational accidents, and they can obtain unpaid leave within the limits permitted by work necessity.

# 7.4.2. Results of the questionnaire in Tunisia:

The results of implementing the questionnaire in Tunisia showed the following indicators:

- 1. 52% of educators do not have an assistant.
- 2. 76% of educators are between 22 and 45 years old, and 21% are over 45 years old.
- 3. 44% of educators hold a technical degree, 16% have a professional degree, and 18% have a high school diploma or less.
- 4. 52% of educators specialize in the field of early childhood and 17% in the field of education.
- 5. 20% of educators have less than one year of work experience in the field.
- 6. 51% of the participating educators are arts teachers (music, theater, drawing, etc.)
- 7. 91% of educators are responsible for one class or section.
- 8. 45% of educators have more than one to five children in each class, while 36% of them have 11 to 15 children.
- 9. The largest percentage of educators work in an educational institution affiliated with the private sector (62%), while the percentage of workers in the public sector was 25%.
- 10. 29% of educators do not have employment contracts regulating their relationship with the institution in which they work, and 30% of those who have contracts reported that the contract is a one-year contract only.
- 11. 47% of educators reported that the educational qualifications required in the job advertisement were a university degree.
- 12. 36% of educators responded that the job advertisement did not require a minimum level of experience.
- 13. 66% of educators reported that their employment contract does not require them to join training programs, and 45% confirmed that they did not participate in training programs in their institutions.
- 14. 52% of educators reported that they receive wages less (24%) or equal (28%) to the minimum wage.
- 15. 38% of educators do not receive their wages on time.
- 16. 49% of educators believe that their income differs from their counterparts in similar environments, such as educators in other institutions, and 33% believe it is the same.
- 17. 87% of educators do not receive any additional incentive for their work.
- 18. 65% of educators reported that the stipulated number of working hours is 6 to 8 hours.
- 19. 70% of educators confirmed that their institutions do not adhere to or exceed the stipulated number of working hours.
- 20. 28% of educators are dissatisfied with their responsibilities and 39% of them are somewhat satisfied.
- 21. 58% of educators do not receive any administrative or logistical support from the institution where they work.

- 22. 20% of educators reported that there is no educational coordinator within the institution, and if there is one, 46% reported that the meeting with the coordinator is not periodic, but only upon request.
- 23. 74% of educators do not have a reference for submitting complaints.

#### 7.5. Oman Results:

#### 7.5.1. Oman desk review results:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Oman showed the following results:

- 1. The number of pre-school education institutions increased from 49 in 2009/2010 to approximately 674.
- 2. Children's enrolment rates in preschool education increased to 57% in the year 2021/2022.
- 3. In 2015, the National Strategy for Childhood in the Sultanate of Oman 2015-2025 was released.
- 4. A nursery in Oman is a private social institution that falls under the supervision of the Ministry of Social Development and provides services for children from six months to three and a half years.
- 5. The number of nurseries in the states of the Sultanate has increased until it reached 320 nurseries in 2021, with 6,073 children, and 1,371 employees.
- 6. Since 2014, courses have been provided for teachers and supervisory and administrative bodies in the early childhood stage.
- 7. The most prominent challenges facing the preschool education sector in Oman are the lack of specialists in local universities, and the need to build the capabilities of workers in the field of early childhood development.

# 7.5.2. Results of the questionnaire in Oman:

The results of implementing the questionnaire in Oman showed the following indicators:

1)

#### 7.6. Lebanon Results:

#### 7.6.1. Lebanon desk review results:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Lebanon showed the following results:

- 1. Responsibility for early childhood institutions in Lebanon is divided upon the Ministry of Public Health, which is responsible for nurseries, the Ministry of Social Affairs, which is responsible for child care centers, and the Ministry of Education and Higher Education, which is responsible for kindergartens.
- 2. The number of schools that contain kindergartens is 2021, and the largest number of them are in the private paying sector.
- 3. The number of students reached 185,883 students, the largest number of whom were in the private paying sector.

- 4. Preparation of kindergarten and primary education teachers takes place in the faculties of pedagogy.
- 5. The largest number of workers in kindergartens are from the teaching staff at 54.80%, while contractors constitute a high percentage of 38.71%.
- 6. The largest percentage of members of the administrative and educational bodies hold an academic certificate or bachelor's degree.
- 7. Educational staff members in private schools benefit from the services of the National Social Security Fund.
- 8. In the year 2004, Decree No. 12286 (dated 4/15/2004) was issued and stipulated the legal, regulatory, and administrative provisions governing the conditions for licensing the opening and investment of child nurseries in Lebanon.
- 9. There are 458 private nurseries, and many of the private nurseries are unlicensed and difficult to count.
- 10. A license to open and operate a nursery is granted by decision of the Minister of Public Health.
- 11. There is an urgent need for continuous training for educators.

# 7.6.2. Results of the questionnaire in Lebanon:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Lebanon showed the following results:

- 1. 72% of respondents are educators, 15% administration and management, and 9% educator's assistants.
- 2. 84% of educators teach kindergarten classes and 12% have nursery classes
- 3. 61% of educators do not have an assistant.
- 4. The largest percentage of educators belong to the age group between 22 and 45 years.
- 5. 60% of educators have a university or master's degree, and 34% have a technical or professional degree.
- 6. 64% of educators specialize in the field of education, and 14% in the field of early childhood.
- 7. The largest percentage of educators is in private sector nurseries and kindergartens (84%)
- 8. Most educators have employment contracts linking their employment relationship with their institutions and they work full-time.
- 9. 34% of educators have one-year employment contracts, which indicates instability about their career future.
- 10. 81% of educators receive wages less than (27%), equal to (26%), or slightly more than (28%) the minimum wage.
- 11. Although 45% of educators stated that their contract or job description did not include the obligation for them to join training programs, 81% confirmed their participation in training programs for educators within their institutions.
- 12. 47% of educators believe that their income differs from that of their counterparts in similar environments, such as educators in other institutions.
- 13. The largest percentage of educators work 6 to 8 hours a day (62%), while the lesser percentage works less than 4 to 6 hours (30%).

# 7.7. Egypt Results:

# 7.7.1. Egypt desk review results:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Egypt showed the following results:

- 1. The number of children's nurseries in Egypt is about 25,000 licensed and unlicensed nurseries. The number of children registered in nurseries is one million.
- 2. Nurseries are subject to the supervision of the Ministry of Social Welfare, and every nursery is committed in its work to the provisions of the Children's Law.
- 3. Nursery workers undergo training from the nursery owner and the nursery director.
- 4. The kindergarten is supervised by the oldest and highest-ranking teacher, and in accordance with the texts and articles of Law No. 155 pre-service teachers receive professional preparation from the colleges.

# 7.7.2. Results of the questionnaire in Egypt:

The results provided by the desk review reports in Egypt showed the following results:

- 1. 52% of educators do not have an assistant.
- 2. 75% of educators are between the ages of 22 and 45 years, and 25% are over 45 years old.
- 3. 96% of educators hold a university degree.
- 4. 65% of educators specialize in the field of education and 32% in the field of early childhood.
- 5. 80% of educators have more than 10 years of work experience in the field.
- 6. 74% of educators are responsible for one class or section.
- 7. The number of children in each class was more than 15 for 90% of the educators.
- 8. 76% of educators work in an educational institution affiliated with the private sector.
- 9. 72% of educators have employment contracts regulating their relationship with the institution in which they work, and 68% of those who have contracts reported that the contract is a permanent contract.
- 10. 62% of educators reported that the educational qualifications required in the job advertisement were a university degree in the field of education.
- 11. 77% of educators responded that the job advertisement did not require a minimum level of experience.
- 12. 35% of educators reported that their employment contract does not require them to join training programs, but 82% confirmed that they had participated in training programs in their institutions.
- 13. 78% of educators reported that they receive wages less than (24%) or equal (54%) to the minimum wage.
- 14. 32% of educators believe that their income differs from their counterparts in similar environments, such as educators in other institutions.
- 15. 68% do not receive any additional incentives for their work
- 16. For 49% of educators, the stipulated number of working hours was 6 to 8 hours per day, and for 50%, it was 4 to 6 hours per day.
- 17. 81% of educators reported that their institutions adhere to the stipulated number of working hours and do not exceed them.

- 18. 60% of educators do not receive any administrative or logistical support from the institution where they work.
- 19. 95% of educators reported that they meet with the educational program coordinator on a daily basis.
- 20. 26% of educators do not have a reference for submitting complaints.